3.15 Recreation

This section evaluates the potential impacts of the Proposed Action on recreation. This evaluation includes an assessment of the direct, indirect, short-term, long-term, and cumulative effects of the Proposed Action on existing and planned recreational uses and trail alignments. The evaluation is based on a review of applicable recreational planning documents and maps, and the Recreation Master Plan Update prepared by Estrada Land Planning (ELP, 2007), which is included as Appendix A to this EIR/EIS.

3.15.1 Affected Environment

3.15.1.1 Environmental Setting

The following discussion describes the existing recreational facilities within the SV 100K study area.

Recreational Facilities in the Region

Recreational land uses include neighborhood parks, regional parks, and regional recreational facilities. Neighborhood parks are often located in urban areas and provide active uses such as ballparks, picnic areas, and playgrounds.

According to the San Diego County General Plan Recreation Element (1993), regional parks include two types of parks: (1) relatively large parks (in excess of 200 acres), which provide the impression of remoteness, spaciousness, diversity of use, and environment, and (2) small parks that are of historical, unusual geographic, cultural or recreational interest to a broad spectrum of the population. Table 3.15-1 shows Regional Parks operated by the San Diego County Department of Parks and Recreation.

Regional recreational facilities are generally located away from urban areas and provide for both active and passive uses, such as hiking, biking and riding equestrian trails, fishing, boating, water sports, and camping. Regional recreational facilities take advantage of natural features such as lakes, reservoirs, cliffs, hills, and natural undisturbed areas. The County Open Space Preserves that are located in the vicinity of San Vicente Reservoir (refer to Section 3.6.1.2 [Biological Resources for the Proposed Action, Other Regional Open Space Planning Efforts] and Figure 3.6-3), as well as the reservoir itself, are considered a regional recreational facility.

Water-based recreational opportunities, such as fishing, boating, and waterskiing, are popular in San Diego County. Such opportunities are provided by the Pacific Ocean, Mission Bay Regional Park, and 20 freshwater reservoirs located throughout the County (CIC Research, 2007; Appendix H of this EIR/EIS). The capacities of the reservoirs providing water-based recreational activities vary between 2,610 acre-feet (AF) at Dixon Lake to 113,000 AF at El Capitan Reservoir. A variety of activities may be offered at each of the reservoirs, including boating (e.g., power, row, sail, and personal watercraft), fishing, hunting, hiking, equestrian trails, and camping. Nine reservoirs offer fishing (shoreline and boat) on a limited seasonal basis. Waterskiing, wakeboarding, and towing of inflatables are offered at two reservoirs: San
Vicente and El Capitan. San Vicente is the only lake that allows year-round waterskiing. El Capitan is the only reservoir that allows personal watercraft such as jet skis. None of the reservoirs allow swimming.

Table 3.15-1. San Diego County Regional Parks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regional Park</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Campground</th>
<th>Picnic Area</th>
<th>Playground</th>
<th>Hiking Trails</th>
<th>Equine Trails</th>
<th>Bike Trails</th>
<th>Open Fields (Athletic)</th>
<th>Wedding Facilities</th>
<th>Horseshoe Pits</th>
<th>Wildlife Viewing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dos Picos</td>
<td>Ramona</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Monte</td>
<td>Lakeside</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felicita</td>
<td>Escondido</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flinn Springs</td>
<td>El Cajon</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otay Lakes</td>
<td>Chula Vista</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pine Valley</td>
<td>Pine Valley</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potrero</td>
<td>Potrero</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Dieguito</td>
<td>Solana Beach</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stelzer</td>
<td>Lakeside</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweetwater</td>
<td>Bonita</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tijuana River Valley</td>
<td>San Diego</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: County of San Diego, Parks and Recreation, 2007

San Vicente Reservoir Recreational Facilities

As shown in Figure 3.15-1, existing recreational areas at San Vicente Reservoir include the marina and associated facilities at the southwest end of the reservoir (approximately 0.5 miles from the existing dam). The facilities at the marina include a launch ramp with three lanes, a floating boat dock and floating courtesy dock with 70 rental and private boat slips, a 36-foot-long floating fishing pier, a shoreline fishing path, parking, picnic area, offices for rangers and employees, and a comfort station. Eleven persons are currently employed at the reservoir, including one Reservoir Keeper, one Assistant Reservoir Keeper, five Lake Aids (two Class II and three Class I), and four Rangers. Parking is provided at the marina for approximately 55 vehicles and an additional 100 cars with trailers. Entry to the reservoir is limited to one access road.

For safety, up to 100 water ski boats are allowed on the reservoir at any one time, and entrance to the reservoir is on a first-come, first-serve basis (refer to Section 3.13 [Public Safety] of this EIR/EIS). In 2004, approximately 85,000 fishing permits, 55,000 water contact permits, and 40,500 boat launch permits were issued (Weber, 2006). In addition, in 2004, approximately 10,000 boat rental permits were issued (Weber, 2006). Day use fees are collected at an entry booth located south of the dam and north of Vigilante Road. During the peak season (May...
through September), the number of people visiting the reservoir per day can range from 40 to 450 (Weber, 2006).

The San Vicente Reservoir allows waterskiing and fishing. To facilitate recreational use of the reservoir, the City of San Diego has established priority times for these conflicting uses. During the “summer” months (i.e., May through October), waterskiing is permitted Thursday through Sunday, and fishing is permitted on Thursday and Friday. In the “winter” months (i.e., November through April), waterskiing is permitted on Thursday and Friday, and fishing is permitted Thursday through Sunday. Sailing is allowed year-round. Water ski boats are limited by the City’s operational constraint of 10 acres per ski boat, which would allow for a maximum of 100 boats on the water at any given time at a surface area of 1,000 acres. The City estimates that approximately 150 boats use the reservoir per day during the summer months (once the daily maximum is reached, new boats are allowed onto the lake only as others leave). Water ski only days tend to be the busiest days on the reservoir (Weber, 2006).

Fishing is a popular recreational activity at San Vicente Reservoir. Several trophy-sized catches of largemouth bass and other species have been recorded at the reservoir. Private recreational groups such as the San Diego Council of Bass Fishermen frequently hold fishing tournaments at the reservoir. A fishing pier is located just north of the marina, and shoreline fishing is permitted just west of the pier. Because of the steep hillsides and large rock outcroppings surrounding the reservoir, few opportunities exist for shoreline activities. However, there are small existing beach areas along the shore that can be reached by boat for picnicking and fishing. Portable toilets located around the perimeter of the reservoir are accessed and maintained by boat. Swimming in the reservoir is not allowed at any time.

There are few existing trails located around San Vicente Reservoir due to the steepness of the surrounding topography. An existing path currently follows the service road alignment located north of the marina area. The path/service road leads to the existing fishing pier and ends south of the First Aqueduct outlet. The path also provides access to the shoreline fishing area between the fishing pier and the aqueduct. Two planned trails are located in the vicinity of the reservoir that are designated by the Lakeside Community Plan: the San Vicente Trail and a section of the Trans-County Trail (Figure 3.15-1). The planned San Vicente Trail would circumnavigate the reservoir beginning just north of the proposed marina and ending on the southeast side of the reservoir where it would meet up with the Trans-County Trail. To date, no portion of the San Vicente Trail has been constructed. The planned portion of the Trans-County Trail would roughly follow the south end of the reservoir below the dam. The Trans-County Trail would eventually extend between Borrego Springs and Del Mar, using existing public lands and public rights-of-way to the extent feasible. Approximately 70 percent of the Trans-County Trail is open for use; however, the segment adjacent to San Vicente Reservoir is not constructed. Both planned trails are documented in the Lakeside Community Trails and Pathways Plan (refer to Section 3.15.1.2 below).
3.15.1.2 Regulatory Setting

The Water Authority is mandated by its principal act, the County Water Authority Act (Stats. 1943, c. 545) to provide water to meet the needs of member agencies in its service area. As defined under this Act, the Water Authority is not subject to local land use plans, policies, and ordinances. Furthermore, water supply facilities are exempt from local zoning per California Government Code Section 53091(d) and (e). According to Section 53091 of the California Government Code, zoning ordinances do not apply to the location or construction of facilities used for the production, generation, storage, or transmission of water. Refer to Section 3.9.1.2 (Regulatory Setting, Land Use and Planning for the Proposed Action) of this EIR/EIS for a discussion of the plans and policies that support the provision of water infrastructure.

3.15.2 Project Design Features

The Proposed Action would include design features to minimize recreation impacts. These design and construction features could include, but would not be limited to, the following:

- Replacement of the existing marina that would be inundated by the expanded reservoir. Based on the enlarged surface area of the reservoir, the proposed marina has been designed to accommodate a larger number of visitors. As described in Section 2.2.1.2 (Alternatives Analyzed) of this EIR/EIS, conceptual recreational facilities at the relocated and expanded marina would include an extended boat launch ramp, docks, piers, parking, and buildings (e.g., concessions, City office and comfort station). Conceptual locations of these facilities are shown in Figure 2.2-11.

3.15.3 Direct and Indirect Effects

3.15.3.1 Thresholds of Significance

Thresholds used to evaluate potential impacts on recreation are based on applicable criteria in the State CEQA Guidelines (CCR §§15000-15387), Appendix G. A significant impact on recreation would occur if the Proposed Action would:

1. Result in the direct disturbance or displacement of established recreation facilities.
2. Increase the use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur or be accelerated.
3. Include recreational facilities or require the construction or expansion of recreational facilities, which might have an adverse physical effect on the environment.
3.15.3.2 Impact Analysis

Methodology

The recreational analysis includes a review of applicable recreational planning documents and maps. The impact assessment evaluates the proposed disruption of reservoir recreational activities, including boating, fishing, waterskiing, and hiking. Impacts on existing recreational uses were analyzed based on the types of effects the project could have upon recreational uses within the study area for the Proposed Action. Impacts on adjacent recreational uses were also considered in instances where the Proposed Action construction or operation could affect the recreational use or operation of such areas.

Analysis

Threshold 1: Result in the direct disturbance or displacement of established recreation facilities

The existing marina at San Vicente Reservoir would be displaced by Proposed Action construction activities, including a possible quarry, and would be permanently inundated when the reservoir is refilled to the higher operational water levels. Recreational facilities at the existing marina and in areas affected by the Proposed Action, and all recreational activities on the reservoir (e.g., boating, waterskiing, fishing, picnicking), would be closed for the duration of time needed to draw down the reservoir water level, construct the enlarged dam, and refill the reservoir to a level sufficient to allow use of the marina. All facility closures would be well marked. The closure of existing recreational facilities and activities at the marina and reservoir is expected to last approximately five to nine years. This estimate is based on typical rainfall patterns and could be longer under drought conditions. Drawdown of the reservoir water level could take between six months and one year depending on the amount of rain received during drawdown (refer to Section 2.2.1.2 [Alternatives Analyzed] of this EIR/EIS). The reservoir would remain at the drawdown level during the construction period, estimated to be approximately three years (refer to Section 2.2.2.3 [Alternatives Analyzed] of this EIR/EIS). Refilling could begin as soon as construction of the dam is at a high enough level to allow additional water to be added to the reservoir, pursuant to the State Division of Safety of Dams (DSOD) concurrence and operable outlet works facilities in place. Depending on the amount of local rainfall and water supply received through San Diego Pipelines 1 and 2, refilling could take between two and five years (refer to Section 2.2.3.1 [Alternatives Analyzed] of this EIR/EIS). Section 2.2.3.1 includes a detailed discussion of construction duration and drawdown time for the Proposed Action.

The Proposed Action involves the relocation and expansion of the San Vicente Marina, which would result in an increase in recreational opportunities at the enlarged reservoir. However, these improvements would not occur until after completion of the dam raise. Due to public safety concerns, interim recreational facilities cannot be provided at San Vicente Reservoir during construction of the Proposed Action. There are no off-site locations under Water...
Authority ownership where interim reservoir recreational facilities may be constructed or expanded to offset for the temporary loss of recreational opportunities at San Vicente Marina and Reservoir during construction of the Proposed Action (refer to discussion under Threshold 3 below). Therefore, impacts on recreational opportunities as a result of temporary closure of the San Vicente Reservoir would be significant.

The Proposed Action is located within the Lakeside Community Trails and Pathways Plan (LCTPP) area. The goal of the LCTPP is to preserve Lakeside’s equestrian heritage and provide a variety of trail experiences to all residents of Lakeside by establishing a network of public riding and hiking trails. The trail network should be physically and functionally integrated with other major transportation facilities. LCTPP Community Specific Goal 1 encourages the development of a multi-use trail around San Vicente Reservoir through the appropriate jurisdictions and agencies. In addition, a planned section of the Trans-County Trail is designated just south of San Vicente Dam, within the SV 100K footprint (Figure 3.15-1). While both planned trails are identified on the Lakeside Trails and Pathways Map, there is no specified timeline for completion of these trails identified in the LCTPP.

The Proposed Action would not affect the planned locations of the San Vicente and Trans-County trails. The intent of the San Vicente Trail is to circumnavigate the reservoir; therefore, future construction of this trail would be required to occur above the PMF level of the enlarged reservoir at 778 feet AMSL. Grading and excavation activities associated with the relocated marina access road and the new foundation of the enlarged dam would not extend into the planned route of the Trans-County Trail segment to the south. The County of San Diego and City of San Diego are responsible for approval and construction of these planned trails. Because there is no specified timeline for completion of these trails identified in the LCTPP, the Proposed Action would not impede the design and approval process. If the timing of this process were such that the trails could be constructed within the construction timeframe of the Proposed Action, then it is anticipated that portions of both trails could be installed at locations that would not conflict with construction activities associated with the Proposed Action. For safety purposes, public use of any completed trails within the SV 100K footprint would be prohibited until after completion of the dam raise. Public use of any completed trails outside the SV 100K footprint would be determined by the City of San Diego and the County of San Diego. Therefore, impacts on trails proposed in the vicinity of the San Vicente Reservoir due to the construction of the Proposed Action would be less than significant.

The Proposed Action would involve displacement and relocation of the existing marina at San Vicente Reservoir, and closure of existing recreational facilities for an extended period. Therefore, impacts of the Proposed Action would be significant (Impact SV/R 1).

The Proposed Action would not affect the planned locations of the San Vicente and Trans-County Trails. Therefore, impacts on trails from the Proposed Action would be less than significant.
Threshold 2: Increase the use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur or be accelerated

Neighborhood and Regional Parks

San Vicente Reservoir is a regional recreational facility predominantly used for boating, waterskiing, and fishing. None of these activities are available at neighborhood or regional parks (Table 3.15-1). Therefore, recreational users seeking alternative locations for these aquatic activities would not go to those parks. Consequently, the temporary loss of water-based recreational activities at San Vicente Reservoir during construction of the Proposed Action would not result in the accelerated use, and/or substantial physical deterioration of recreational facilities at neighborhood and regional parks in the region.

The existing path/service road north of the marina primarily provides pedestrian access to the fishing pier and to the shoreline fishing area, and is not heavily used by hikers and equestrians. Therefore, the temporary loss of this path during construction of the Proposed Action would not result in the accelerated use and substantial physical deterioration of riding and hiking, biking, and equestrian trails at neighborhood and regional parks in the region, and at County Open Space Preserves in the vicinity of the Proposed Action (refer to Section 3.6.1.2 [Biological Resources for the Proposed Action, Other Regional Open Space Planning Efforts] and Figure 3.6-3). Therefore, this impact would be less than significant.

Other Recreational Facilities

Construction (Short-Term) Impacts

During construction of the Proposed Action, water-based recreational users would not have access to San Vicente Reservoir for fishing, boating, waterskiing, wakeboarding, tubing, or picnicking. Such recreational users could use the ocean, Mission Bay, and other reservoirs or lakes in the County such as Lake Hodges, El Capitan Reservoir or Otay Lakes, depending on the type of recreational activity a user wanted to pursue. The impacts of the Proposed Action on water-based recreational activities along the ocean and at Mission Bay will not be considered in this analysis because the specific conditions that attract users to these saltwater locales are distinct from those found at freshwater locations such as San Vicente Reservoir. In general, it is anticipated that marine-based recreational facilities are not an appropriate substitute for freshwater-based facilities.

Recreational facilities at City lakes and reservoirs are summarized in Table 3.15-2. Lake Hodges, El Capitan, and Lower Otay have larger water surface areas and more miles of shoreline when full than San Vicente, while Miramar, Lake Murray and Upper Otay are considerably smaller. All of the City reservoirs have more picnic facilities than San Vicente, except for Upper Otay, which has none. Fishing is allowed from boats at all reservoirs except Upper Otay, but only San Vicente and El Capitan offer waterskiing and wakeboarding.

As part of a previous study for the ESP, CIC Research (1992) conducted a face-to-face survey with 1,000 recreational users at San Diego City lakes. CIC also conducted a telephone survey of
San Diego residents to determine the frequency and types of activities at City lakes. The survey determined that 42 percent of the users of City of San Diego recreational reservoirs were City residents, 52 percent were residents of other areas of the County, and 6 percent were from outside the County. Residents of San Diego rated Lake Murray, El Capitan, Lake Miramar, and Otay Lakes a better recreational experience than San Vicente. About 23 percent of these users reported fishing as the main purpose of their trip. Only 4 percent of these users reported waterskiing as their primary purpose for visiting these lakes.

Table 3.15-2. Recreational Facilities at City Reservoirs/Lakes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reservoir</th>
<th>Surface Area / Shoreline Miles when Full</th>
<th>Picnic Facilities</th>
<th>Fishing Allowed from</th>
<th>Other Boating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>San Vicente</td>
<td>1,069 acres/14 miles</td>
<td>2 BBQ, 6 picnic tables</td>
<td>Boats, float tubes, shore</td>
<td>Waterskiing (year-round), wakeboarding, tubing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lake Hodges</td>
<td>1,234 acres/27 miles</td>
<td>6 BBQ, 12 picnic tables</td>
<td>Boats, float tubes, wading, shore, wheelchair accessible fishing float</td>
<td>Sailing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Capitan</td>
<td>1,562 acres/22 miles</td>
<td>3 BBQ, 8 picnic tables</td>
<td>Boats, float tubes, shore</td>
<td>Waterskiing, wakeboarding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Otay</td>
<td>1,100 acres/25 miles</td>
<td>13 BBQ, 16 picnic tables</td>
<td>Boats, float tubes, shore</td>
<td>Home of Olympic Training Center for rowing sports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miramar</td>
<td>162 acres/4 miles</td>
<td>18 BBQ, 48 picnic tables</td>
<td>Boats, float tubes, shore</td>
<td>Rowboats, 5-hp outboards, canoes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lake Murray</td>
<td>171 acres/3 miles</td>
<td>10 BBQ, 64 picnic tables</td>
<td>Boats, float tubes, shore</td>
<td>Rowboats, 5-hp outboards, canoes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Otay</td>
<td>20 acres</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Float tube or shore catch and release, no boats</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sutherland</td>
<td>557 acres/5 miles</td>
<td>4 BBQ, 12 picnic tables</td>
<td>Boats, float tubes, shore</td>
<td>Waterfowl and turkey hunting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: City of San Diego, 2007

Loss of fishing opportunities during construction of the Proposed Action would result in an increase in fishing at other City of San Diego reservoirs, including special events such as fishing tournaments. San Vicente Reservoir represents nearly 20 percent of the total water surface area available at all City reservoirs combined. Anglers that customarily use San Vicente may opt to use one of the other reservoirs in the region during the period that the San Vicente Reservoir would be closed. This would increase the number of anglers using these other reservoirs.

However, the City encourages catch-and-release fishing at all of their reservoirs, and the program has been very successful (Weber, 2007). Therefore, an increase in fishing at other reservoirs would not affect fish population at these reservoirs. In addition, the shifting of users from San Vicente Reservoir to other City of San Diego recreational lakes would not result in overcrowding for picnicking or on-shore uses, as these facilities are limited at San Vicente and users view other reservoirs to be superior in terms of these facilities, including reservoirs with substantially smaller water surface areas. Therefore, impacts on fishing and picnicking uses at other facilities would not be significant.
San Vicente Reservoir is one of two freshwater lakes in the County that offer waterskiing, and the only lake that allows year-round waterskiing. The maximum number of ski boats allowed on the reservoir at one time is 100 boats. This maximum is often reached by early morning on summer weekends (July and August) with as many as 50 ski boats queued in the parking area for time on the water. Recreational demand at San Vicente Reservoir exceeds the capacity of weekend waterskiing opportunities during the summer and is a strong indicator of additional latent demand. The loss of access to waterskiing at San Vicente would result in further pressure for waterskiing opportunities at El Capitan, which is the only other City reservoir that allows such use.

The amount of increased recreational use at other City of San Diego reservoirs due to the Proposed Action cannot be predicted. Therefore, under a “worst-case” scenario, it must be assumed that temporary closure of the San Vicente Marina and Reservoir during the SV 100K construction period could contribute to the substantial physical deterioration or acceleration of deterioration of recreational facilities at these reservoirs, if the other facilities are not expanded to meet the increased demand (see Threshold 3 below). Therefore, the impact would be significant.

Operational (Long-Term) Impacts

Once San Vicente Reservoir is refilled and the relocated and enhanced marina facilities are completed, there would be a net increase in City of San Diego reservoir recreational facilities and a regional benefit to recreational users. The site design for the relocated marina facilities was modified and expanded, in comparison to the previous ESP design, to reflect changes requested by the City of San Diego, owner of these facilities. The City has requested that the marina design accommodate twice the facilities than currently exist, and in some cases additional facilities other than those that were envisioned by the ESP plan. The ESP Recreation Master Plan has been updated to address these changes resulting from the Proposed Action, and is included in Appendix A (refer to Section 2.2.1.2 [Alternatives Analyzed] of this EIR/EIS for a general description of the proposed concept plan). Figure 2.2-12 illustrates the conceptual marina site plan. The proposed marina facilities would also be designed to provide maximum access to disabled persons in compliance with ADA requirements. The relocated/expanded marina would be considered a substantial recreational amenity of the Proposed Action, greatly improving upon the current reservoir recreational experience provided by the existing San Vicente Marina and Reservoir, and benefiting the San Diego region. Therefore, operational impacts of the Proposed Action on recreation would be less than significant.

The Proposed Action would not result in the accelerated use and substantial physical deterioration of recreational facilities and riding/hiking trails at neighborhood and regional parks in the region. Therefore, impacts of the Proposed Action would be less than significant.

The Proposed Action may cause an increase in use of other recreational lakes for fishing and picnicking or other on-shore uses during construction. However, the City has successful catch-and-release fishing programs and superior on-shore facilities at other reservoirs. Therefore, construction impacts of the Proposed Action would be less than significant.
The Proposed Action may cause an increase in use of other recreational lakes for waterskiing, where facilities are limited, possibly causing an acceleration of the physical deterioration at those other recreational facilities while San Vicente Reservoir is closed for recreation. Therefore, construction impacts of the Proposed Action would be significant (Impact SV/R 2).

The Proposed Action would create an enhanced marina and larger lake surface at San Vicente Reservoir, generating a net increase in City of San Diego reservoir recreational facilities and a regional benefit to recreational users upon project completion. Therefore, operational impacts of the Proposed Action would be less than significant.

Threshold 3: Include recreational facilities or require the construction or expansion of recreational facilities, which might have an adverse physical effect on the environment

Construction of New Recreation Facilities

The proposed construction of the relocated/expanded San Vicente Marina would not result in additional environmental impacts that would extend outside the SV 100K footprint. The proposed replacement and enhancement of recreational facilities at San Vicente Reservoir are consistent with the goals of the County of San Diego Recreation Element and the Lakeside Community Plan. Due to the lack of residences around San Vicente Reservoir, no disruption to surrounding land uses would occur from the expected increase in use of the expanded marina and reservoir. The expected increase in the intensity of recreational activity at San Vicente Marina and Reservoir after construction of the Proposed Action and the expanded reservoir would also not result in additional traffic, air quality, and noise impacts for the reasons stated in Section 3.16.3.2 (Traffic/Circulation for the Proposed Action), Section 3.5.3.2 (Air Quality for the Proposed Action), and Section 3.11.3.2 (Noise for the Proposed Action), respectively.. Therefore, physical effects on the environment due to the relocation and expansion of the San Vicente Marina would be less than significant.

The Recreation Master Plan Update (ELP, 2007) proposes a new path/service road from the marina to shoreline and dock fishing locations north of the marina. Although the Recreation Master Plan does not provide a connection to other County trails, it would not preclude a future trail connection between regional open space parks to the west (Sycamore) and east (Oak Oasis) of San Vicente Reservoir. Therefore, impacts on planned trails in the vicinity of the San Vicente Reservoir due to the Proposed Action would be less than significant.

Construction or Expansion of Existing Recreation Facilities Off Site

As discussed above, the use of other City of San Diego reservoir recreational facilities would have the potential to temporarily increase during construction of the Proposed Action, potentially contributing to the physical deterioration or acceleration of deterioration of recreational facilities at these reservoirs. The City of San Diego maintains jurisdiction of the reservoirs listed in Table 3.15-2. The Water Authority has asked the City about the possibility of expanding recreational use at any of these reservoirs to offset the temporary loss of the San Vicente Marina and Reservoir during Proposed Action construction. However, the City is currently undergoing a
Business Process Re-engineering study, and it is unknown whether the City could commit to constructing or expanding other reservoir recreational facilities now or in the future. Furthermore, the Water Authority does not have the ability to mandate the construction of new reservoir recreational facilities, or the expansion of existing or planned facilities, to meet the possible temporary demand for expanded facilities as a result of the Proposed Action. Therefore, under a worst-case scenario, impacts on off-site existing recreational facilities due to the temporary closure of the San Vicente Marina and Reservoir would be significant.

*The Proposed Action would include expansion of the existing marina at San Vicente Reservoir and would not have an adverse physical effect on the environment. Therefore, impacts of the Proposed Action would be less than significant.*

*The Proposed Action impacts due to potential construction or expansion of other off-site reservoir recreational facilities are unknown. Therefore, impacts of the Proposed Action would be significant (Impact SV/R 3).*

### 3.15.3.3 Mitigation Measures

There are no feasible mitigation measures to reduce: (1) the impacts from closure of San Vicente Marina and Reservoir for an extended period (Impact SV/R 1); (2) the expected increase in use of other recreational lakes for fishing and waterskiing, possibly causing an acceleration of the physical deterioration at those other recreational facilities (Impact SV/R 2); or (3) the unknown potential construction or expansion impacts of other off-site reservoir recreational facilities (Impact SV/R 3).

While the City of San Diego could expand or allow increased use of other reservoir recreational facilities in the region or construct recreational facilities at City lakes that currently do not provide fishing and water sports activities (e.g., bass fishing, waterskiing, and wakeboarding), such mitigation is outside the jurisdictional control of the Water Authority to implement. The Water Authority has asked the City about the possibility of new or increased recreational uses at their other reservoirs. However, it is unknown whether the City could commit to constructing or expanding other reservoir recreational facilities for fishing and water sports now or in the future to compensate for the temporary loss of these activities at San Vicente Marina and Reservoir during construction of the Proposed Action.

### 3.15.3.4 Residual Impacts after Mitigation

Because it is unknown whether the City will construct or expand recreational facilities for fishing and water sports at their other reservoirs to compensate for the temporary loss of these activities at San Vicente Marina and Reservoir during construction of the Proposed Action, it is assumed that potential impacts on other City reservoir recreational facilities would be significant and unmitigable. The fully implemented Proposed Action would ultimately provide greater fishing and water sports recreational opportunities for recreational users.
A Statement of Overriding Considerations would be necessary for project approval. Significant impacts on recreation (Impacts SV/R 1, SV/R 2, and SV/R 3) would cease upon completion of the new and expanded San Vicente Marina subsequent to the dam raise and refilling of San Vicente Reservoir.

### 3.15.4 Cumulative Effects

#### 3.15.4.1 Other CIP Projects

As described in Section 3.2 (Cumulative Projects for the Proposed Action) of this EIR/EIS, it was determined that the Slaughterhouse Terminal Reservoir would be the only CIP project with the potential to contribute cumulative impacts when combined with the Proposed Action since they are located within two miles of one another. The PEIR for the Regional Water Facilities Master Plan concluded that the Water Authority’s projects and other reasonably foreseeable projects could have cumulative significant adverse impacts on recreational resources in the region. Program-level mitigation measures included the relocation of displaced recreational facilities or restoration of disturbed recreational facilities. The above conclusions regarding cumulative recreation impacts for the CIP project described above are incorporated into the cumulative recreation analyses in Section 3.15.4.3 below.

#### 3.15.4.2 ESP Projects

The ESP EIR/EIS noted that the ESP would temporarily affect lake recreation during construction for alternatives involving existing reservoirs; however, recreational opportunities would be enhanced upon project completion. Also, many of the developments in the ESP cumulative set of projects included land set aside for open space and community parks. The San Vicente Surge Control Facility, currently under construction at the San Vicente site, would be completed before construction of the Proposed Action would begin. Cumulative recreation impacts of ESP were determined to be less than significant. The above conclusions regarding recreation impacts for the ESP projects are incorporated into the cumulative recreation analyses in Section 3.15.4.3.

#### 3.15.4.3 Other Planned Projects with CIP and ESP Projects

This section evaluates the cumulative recreation impacts of the Proposed Action when considered in conjunction with the other planned projects listed in Table 3.2-1, and incorporates the cumulative recreation impacts associated with the CIP and ESP projects described in the above sections. The following cumulative recreation analysis addresses each of the three significance thresholds listed in Section 3.15.3 above.
**Cumulative Threshold 1: Result in the direct disturbance or displacement of established recreation facilities**

The Proposed Action would involve displacement, relocation and expansion of the existing marina at San Vicente Reservoir, and closure of existing recreational facilities for an extended period. The existing marina at San Vicente Reservoir would be displaced by project construction and inundation when the reservoir is refilled to its planned future operational water levels. The disruption of existing recreational activities would be temporary and is expected to last approximately five to nine years. In addition, the Proposed Action would not affect the planned locations of the San Vicente and Trans-County trails that are designated within the SV 100K footprint (Figure 3.15-1). The cumulative projects in the vicinity of the Proposed Action include five mining projects and a number of residential subdivisions (refer to Figure 3.2-1). According to Table 3.2-1, nearby extraction projects, such as Baxter Major Use Permit (MUP 89-033-03) and Enniss Sand Mine (Permit 87-075-01), are not located in areas set aside for recreation. Lakeside Ranch has delineated 70 percent of its site for open space. Lakeside Downs dedicated 214 acres to open space out of 412 total acres of the development site. The cumulative projects included in this analysis would not generate significant permanent cumulative impacts on established recreational facilities. However, the Proposed Action would have a substantial effect on its own and would be considered cumulatively considerable. Therefore, short-term (construction-related) cumulative recreational impacts due to the Proposed Action, when combined with recreation impacts from the CIP, ESP, and other planned cumulative projects listed above, would be significant (*Impact SV/R 1C*).

**Cumulative Threshold 2: Increase the use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur or be accelerated**

The Proposed Action may cause an increase in the use of other recreational lakes for fishing and waterskiing, possibly causing an acceleration of the physical deterioration at those other recreational facilities as a result of the temporary closure of the marina at the San Vicente Reservoir. However, once San Vicente Reservoir is refilled and the relocated and enhanced marina facilities are completed, there would be a net increase in City of San Diego reservoir recreational facilities and a regional benefit to recreational users. The cumulative projects in the vicinity of the Proposed Action include five mining projects and a number of residential subdivisions (refer to Figure 3.2-1). Building new homes in the vicinity of the Proposed Action would increase the use of neighborhood and regional parks and other recreational facilities by residents in the area. However, mining activities such as Baxter Major Use Permit (MUP 89-033-03) and Enniss Sand Mine (Permit 87-075-01) would not affect recreational facilities. Construction and operation of the Slaughterhouse Terminal reservoir (CIP) project and the ESP components associated with the Proposed Action would also not increase the use of existing neighborhood or regional parks or other recreations facilities. However, the Proposed Action would have a substantial effect on its own, which would be cumulatively considerable. Therefore, cumulative recreation impacts due to construction of the Proposed Action, when combined with recreation impacts from the CIP, ESP, and other planned cumulative projects listed above, would be significant (*Impact SV/R 2C*).
**Cumulative Threshold 3: Include recreational facilities or require the construction or expansion of recreational facilities, which might have an adverse physical effect on the environment**

The proposed construction of the relocated/expanded San Vicente Marina would not result in additional environmental impacts that would extend outside the SV 100K footprint. However, the temporary closure of recreation facilities at the San Vicente Reservoir may temporarily increase use of other recreational facilities in the county that have similar uses. The Proposed Action impacts due to potential construction or expansion of other off-site reservoir recreational facilities are unknown. The cumulative projects in the vicinity of the Proposed Action include five mining projects and a number of residential subdivisions (refer to Figure 3.2-1). For larger developments, like Lakeside Ranch and Lakeside Downs, planning agencies generally require that the development include recreational facilities, such as neighborhood parks and playgrounds. However, both developments also plan to designate a portion of their property as open space. Lakeside Ranch home development has delineated 70 percent of its site for open space, while Lakeside Downs home development has dedicated 214 acres to open space out of 412 total acres of the development site. The cumulative projects included in this analysis would not generate significant permanent cumulative impacts on recreation. The Slaughterhouse Terminal Reservoir (CIP) project and the other ESP project components associated with the San Vicente Reservoir would not include construction of recreational facilities. However, the Proposed Action would have a substantial effect on its own, which would be cumulatively considerable. Therefore, cumulative physical deterioration of off-site recreational facilities as a result of the Proposed Action, when combined with the construction of recreation facilities associated with the CIP, ESP and other planned cumulative projects listed above, would be significant (Impact SV/R 3C).

The Proposed Action would involve displacement and relocation of the existing marina at San Vicente Reservoir and closure of existing recreational facilities for an extended period and may cause an increase in use of other recreational lakes (especially for waterskiing), possibly causing an acceleration of the physical deterioration at those other recreational facilities. In addition the Proposed Action impacts due to potential construction or expansion of other off-site reservoir recreational facilities are unknown. Therefore, short-term (construction-related) cumulative recreation impacts due to the Proposed Action, when combined with recreational impacts of the Slaughterhouse Terminal Reservoir (CIP) project and the ESP projects associated with the San Vicente Reservoir and other cumulative projects listed in Table 3.2-1, would be significant for the duration of construction. No feasible measures are available to mitigate the cumulative recreational impacts of the Proposed Action (Impacts SV/R 1C, SV/R 2C, and SV/R 3C). However, these cumulative impacts would cease upon completion of construction. A Statement of Overriding Considerations would be necessary for project approval.
EXISTING RECREATIONAL FACILITIES, NATURAL FEATURES AND PLANNED TRAILS AT SAN VICENTE RESERVOIR

SOURCE: ESP FER, 1995

Figure 3.15-1